



**Legislative Assembly
Province of Alberta**

No. 23

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

Fourth Session

Twenty-Fourth Legislature

Wednesday, April 5, 2000

The Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

Presenting Petitions

Mrs. O'Neill, Hon. Member for St. Albert, presented a petition from 19 Edmonton and St. Albert residents requesting that Regional Health Authorities be allowed to contract out surgical services.

Mr. Boutilier, Hon. Member for Fort McMurray, presented a petition from 19 Albertans requesting that Regional Health Authorities be allowed to contract out surgical services.

Mr. White, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Calder, presented a petition from 272 Edmonton and area residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, presented a petition from 318 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, presented a petition from 325 Edmonton and area residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, presented a petition from 210 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview, presented a petition from 247 Edmonton and area residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, presented a petition from 209 Calgary and Canmore residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, presented a petition from 245 Albertans requesting the introduction of a bill banning the establishment of private for-profit hospitals in Alberta to maintain the integrity of the public, universal health care system.

Reading and Receiving Petitions

On request by Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of the Province of Alberta, hereby petition the Legislative Assembly to pass a bill banning private for-profit hospitals in Alberta so that the integrity of the public, universal health care system may be maintained.

On request by Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Alberta Government to take an enlightened preventative approach and add the newer and more effective medications and therapies to the Alberta drug list to ensure the health of an aging society.

On request by Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Dr. Massey, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mill Woods, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. White, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Calder, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

Tabling Returns and Reports

Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness:

Legal opinion dated March 27, 2000, on the relationship between the Canada Health Act and the proposed Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, prepared by Professor J.C. Levy, Faculty of Law, University of Calgary

Sessional Paper 482/2000

Letter dated April 5, 2000, from Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, to Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, requesting confirmation of Mrs. MacBeth's intentions regarding the transfer of her records, as a former Minister of Health, to the Provincial Archives of Alberta

Sessional Paper 483/2000

Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, pursuant to the Regional Health Authorities Act, cR-9.07, s13(3):

Aspen Regional Health Authority #11, Annual Report 1998-99	Sessional Paper 484/2000
Lakeland Regional Health Authority, Annual Report 1998-99	Sessional Paper 485/2000
Mistahia Health Region, Annual Report 1998-99	Sessional Paper 486/2000
Peace Health Region, Annual Report 1998-99	Sessional Paper 487/2000
Keeweenok Lakes Regional Health Authority #15, Annual Report 1998-99	Sessional Paper 488/2000
Northern Lights Regional Health Services, Annual Report 1998-99	Sessional Paper 489/2000
Northwestern Health Services Region, Annual Report 1998-99	Sessional Paper 490/2000
Capital Health Authority, Annual Report 1998-99	Sessional Paper 491/2000
Crossroads Regional Health Authority, Annual Report 1998-99	Sessional Paper 492/2000
David Thompson Health Region (DHR), Annual Report 1998-99	Sessional Paper 493/2000
WestView Regional Health Authority, Annual Report 1998-99	Sessional Paper 494/2000
East Central Regional Health Authority #7, Annual Report 1998-99	Sessional Paper 495/2000
Calgary Regional Health Authority (CRHA), Annual Report 1998-99	Sessional Paper 496/2000
Headwaters Health Authority, Annual Report 1998-99	Sessional Paper 497/2000
Palliser Health Authority, Annual Report 1998-99	Sessional Paper 498/2000
Chinook Health Region (CHR), Annual Report 1998-99	Sessional Paper 499/2000
Health Authority #5, Annual Report 1998-99	Sessional Paper 500/2000

Hon. Mr. Paszkowski, Minister of Municipal Affairs, pursuant to the Safety Codes Act, cS-0.5, s22(3):

Safety Codes Council, Annual Report 1999

Sessional Paper 501/2000

Hon. Mr. Woloshyn, Minister of Community Development:

Letter dated March 29, 2000, from Hon. Mr. Woloshyn, Minister of Community Development, to Rob Daum, Head Coach, University of Alberta Golden Bears Hockey Team, congratulating the Golden Bears hockey team for winning a second consecutive CIAU (Canadian Interuniversity Athletic Union) championship during the weekend of April 1-2, 2000

Sessional Paper 502/2000

Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition:

Data table entitled "Provincial Government Health Expenditure, by Use of Funds, Alberta, 1975 to 1999 - Current Dollars"

Sessional Paper 503/2000

Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo:

Summary of expenses of the Alberta Liberal Caucus for advertising costs incurred promoting opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 504/2000

Blank checklist intended for Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, to list Government advertising costs incurred promoting Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 505/2000

Petition signed by 606 Vermillion residents opposing the privatization of health care services

Sessional Paper 506/2000

67 letters from Medicine Hat residents to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing opposition to the proposal to allow Regional Health Authorities to enter into contractual arrangements with private for-profit hospitals

Sessional Paper 507/2000

Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview:

Excerpts from "The Camsell Mosaic" regarding the life of Dr. Charles Camsell

Sessional Paper 508/2000

Graduate Nurse Diploma from the University of Calgary and Registered Nurse registration certificate from the Alberta Association of Registered Nurses issued to Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview

Sessional Paper 509/2000

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford:

E-mail message, undated, from Joan Leslie to all Members of the Legislative Assembly, expressing opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act
Sessional Paper 510/2000

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre:

Government of Ontario press release dated March 3, 2000, entitled "Harris government protects public health care - private hospitals to close"
Sessional Paper 511/2000

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie:

5 letters from Kevin Milliken, Lance Steinke, and Bill Marshall, all of Canmore, Chris Fitznar of Banff and Maegan Hawkes of Calgary, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing opposition to the development of the Spray Lakes area by the Genesis Land Corporation
Sessional Paper 512/2000

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora:

3 copies of an information booklet entitled "Here's your complete copy of Bill 11, Alberta's Health Care Protection Act - A stronger health system for the future" prepared by Alberta Health and Wellness, with notations opposing the Bill
Sessional Paper 513/2000

Letter dated March 22, 2000, from Marcel Gibello, Edmonton, to Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, regarding the purchase of MRIs (magnetic resonance imaging) in Calgary
Sessional Paper 514/2000

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar:

Document entitled "Strike Timeline" outlining the events of striking Calgary Herald workers from November 8, 1999 to April 5, 2000
Sessional Paper 515/2000

Document entitled "Labour board decisions still pending" outlining the disposition of several CEP (Communications, Energy, Paperworkers) local 115A union complaints filed with the Alberta Labour Relations Board with respect to the strike at the Calgary Herald
Sessional Paper 516/2000

Transcript of confrontation between Conrad Black, Calgary Herald owner, and Andy Marshall, CEP (Communications, Energy, Paperworkers) local 115A
Sessional Paper 517/2000

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona:

Letter from Dr. W.A. Fuller, Ph.D., Athabasca, to Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, letter from E.J. Kowal, Edmonton, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, and e-mail message from David Finch, Calgary, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, Hon. Mr. Day, Provincial Treasurer, Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, and Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, opposing Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 518/2000

Oral Question Period

During Oral Question Period, Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, tabled the following:

Document dated November 29, 1999, entitled "Background on Private Provision of Medical and Hospital Services in Other Jurisdictions" prepared by Evelyn Swanson and Celso Teixeira, Policy and Planning Services Division, Alberta Health and Wellness

Sessional Paper 519/2000

Recognitions

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar: Douglas and Cherie Gillett, Edmonton residents who are actively involved in the community, and the celebration of their 50th wedding anniversary

Mr. Coutts, Hon. Member for Livingstone-Macleod: 100th anniversary of postal service in Cowley, the activities surrounding this event and the postmasters who have served in Cowley for the past 100 years

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark: Edmonton West Raiders girls soccer team for winning a silver medal at the provincial soccer championships held in Calgary March 18-19, 2000

Mr. Fischer, Hon. Member for Wainwright: Daysland Peewee-A Thunder Stars from Wainwright on winning the gold medal at the 2000 Alberta Winter Games held in Sherwood Park, the league championship, and the Provincial Peewee Hockey Championship held in Wainwright, March 24-26, 2000

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona: The late Tommy Douglas, the "father of medicare" for his work in creating a universal medicare system in Canada

Mrs. Forsyth, Hon. Member for Calgary-Fish Creek: Jamie Sale, David Pelletier, and Kristy Sargeant, participants in the World Figure Skating Championship in Nice, France, March 20 - 26, 2000

Ms Paul, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Castle Downs: Sergeant James Brown, Edmonton Garrison, for receiving a rescue commendation from the Royal Life Saving Society

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Written Questions

The following Written Question was accepted:

WQ10. Moved by Mr. Wickman on behalf of Mrs. Soetaert:

How much has the Government saved each year from 1996-97 to 1998-99 as a result of contracting out highway maintenance and on what evidence are the figures based?

The following Written Questions were accepted as amended:

WQ7. Moved by Mr. Sapers on behalf of Ms Carlson:

What was the total number of contaminated sites recorded by Alberta Environment on December 31, 1999; how many of these were underground petroleum storage sites; how many of the remaining sites were classified as severely, moderately or lightly contaminated; how many were unclassified and how many in each category had been visited and reviewed between January 1, 1998 and December 31, 1999?

Hon. Mr. Mar, Minister of Environment, moved the motion be amended to read:

What was the *approximate* total number of contaminated sites recorded by Alberta Environment on December 31, 1999; how many of these were underground petroleum storage sites; and how many had been visited and reviewed between January 1, 1998 and December 31, 1999?

WQ8. Moved by Mr. Sapers on behalf of Dr. Nicol:

What are the estimated costs of operating Alberta's trade offices and engaging trade consultants under contract abroad for the fiscal year 1998-99, broken down by accommodation costs and salary ranges for: consultants, clerical staff, commercial officers and posted staff?

Hon. Mr. Mar, Minister of Environment on behalf of the Hon. Mr. Havelock, Minister of Economic Development, moved the motion be amended to read:

What are the *actual* costs of operating Alberta's trade offices and engaging trade consultants under contract abroad for the fiscal year 1998-99, broken down by *posted staffing costs, locally engaged administrative and clerical staffing costs, accommodation and operating costs, and what was the salary range for posted staff?*

The following Written Questions were ordered to stand:

WQ11, WQ12, WQ13, WQ14.

Motions for Returns

The following Motion for Returns was accepted:

MR15. Moved by Mr. Wickman on behalf of Mr. White:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:

A list of all contracts issued by the Alberta Forest Service in the calendar year 1999, indicating the purpose of each contract, the name of the company to which it was awarded and whether the contract was awarded as a result of a public tendering process.

The following Motions for Returns were accepted as amended:

MR14. Moved by Mr. Gibbons on behalf of Ms Carlson:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:

A monthly summary of all monitoring results, and any individual values that exceed permitted limits, from April 1, 1997 to February 28, 2000, collected by Chem-Security (Alberta) Ltd. and Bovar Inc., as required by the approval to operate the Alberta Special Waste Treatment Centre at Swan Hills and by the Enforcement Order announced by Alberta Environmental Protection on January 15, 1997.

Hon. Mr. Mar, Minister of Environment, moved the motion be amended to read:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:

A monthly summary of all monitoring results, and any individual values that exceed permitted limits, from April 1, 1997 to February 28, 2000, collected by Chem-Security (Alberta) Ltd. and Bovar Inc., as required by the approval to operate the Alberta Special Waste Treatment Centre at Swan Hills.

MR24. Moved by Mr. Sapers on behalf of Dr. Nicol:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:

Copies of activity reports prepared by the Department of Economic Development on Alberta trade offices and trade consultants abroad for the fiscal years 1997-98 and 1998-99.

Hon. Mr. Mar, Minister of Environment, on behalf of Hon. Mr. Havelock, Minister of Economic Development, moved the motion be amended to read:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:
Copies of *monthly report summaries* prepared by the Department of Economic Development on Alberta trade offices abroad for the fiscal years 1997-98 and 1998-99.

The following Motion for Returns was rejected:

MR13. Moved by Mr. Gibbons on behalf of Ms Carlson:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:
A copy of the plan that Chem-Security (Alberta) Ltd. and Bovar Inc. were required to draw up under the Enforcement Order that was announced by Alberta Environmental Protection on January 15, 1997, showing how they will address all sources of PCBs, dioxins and furans identified in the inventory required by the Enforcement Order, together with a copy of any design plans that were subsequently drawn up to address any potential adverse impacts on the environment, and any evaluation of these plans carried out by, or for, those companies or Alberta Environment (or Alberta Environmental Protection) from that time until February 28, 2000.

Hon. Mr. Mar, Minister of Environment, tabled the following:

Report, dated April 1998, entitled "Swan Hills Treatment Centre Assessment Plan - Response to Enforcement Order 97-01", prepared by Bovar Waste Management for Alberta Environmental Protection
Sessional Paper 520/2000

MR16. Moved by Mr. Sapers on behalf of Dr. Nicol:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:
Copy of all studies and reports prepared by, or for, the Government Reorganization Secretariat between May 26, 1999 and February 17, 2000, relating to a review of government agencies, boards and commissions.

The following Motions for Returns were ordered to stand:

MR18, MR19, MR20, MR21, MR22, MR25, MR26, MR27, MR28, MR29, MR30.

Public Bills and Orders Other Than Government Bills and Orders

Second Reading

The following Bill was read a Second time and referred to Committee of the Whole:

Bill 206 School (Students' Code of Conduct) Amendment Act, 2000 — Mr. Coutts

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 207 Provincial-Municipal Tax Sharing Calculation Act — Mrs. MacBeth

A debate followed.

Hon. Mr. Paszkowski moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to.

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 5:13 p.m. until 8:00 p.m.

WEDNESDAY, APRIL 5, 2000— 8:00 P.M.

Government Bills and Orders

Second Reading

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 11 Health Care Protection Act — Hon. Mr. Klein on behalf of the Hon.
Mr. Jonson

A debate followed.

Mrs. O'Neill moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to.

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 10:04 p.m. until Thursday, April 6, 2000, at 1:30 p.m.

Hon. Ken Kowalski,
Speaker

Title: Wednesday, April 5, 2000